

**Carnbee Owners Association
Annual General Meeting
Meeting held on Monday 9 September 2019, 1900hrs
Gracemount High School, Edinburgh**

Minutes

Item	Details	Action
1	<p>Welcome and Apologies</p> <p>Good evening Ladies and Gentlemen and thank you for coming to the 10th AGM of the Carnbee Owners Association. There are 19 members' present, 48 proxy forms received, giving a total of 67 owners represented. Under the terms of the constitution at annual or other general meetings of the Association, no meeting shall be considered quorate unless a minimum of fifty (50) Members are present or represented by a proxy. The AGM is therefore quorate in accordance with our constitution. There are no apologies.</p> <p>With skilful handling by the committee we continue to head in the right direction. Greenfingers, our ground contractor do an excellent job in trying to keep the estate looking pristine but are hampered by council neglect with respect to clearing weeds on pavements and the roads in our estate. Some road sweeping in the autumn would be much appreciated. We have instructed Greenfinger's to spray the weeds but it doesn't appear to have been very effective.</p>	
2	<p>Minutes of last AGM held 10 September 2018</p> <p>Minutes and accounts from our 2018 AGM were posted on our website and paper copies provided to those who requested them.</p>	
3	<p>Matters Arising from the minutes (10 September 2018)</p> <p>Mr and Mrs Robinson, 61 Carnbee Avenue</p> <p>Mr & Mrs Robinson had a number of complaints regarding the area around their house. First was the proximity of tall Pine trees and pine cones falling onto their house? As we are in a TPO area we are not allowed to touch them unless they are dying, diseased or</p>	

	<p>decaying. We asked Mr & Mrs Robinson to obtain permission for us to do the work but as yet we have we have received no instructions. Second a certain individual was using the area opposite their house as a toilet. They had reported the issue to the police but this was ineffective. Third the waste bin opposite their property was often overflowing and foul smelling. It was Council property and we could not move it neither were we aware of who asked for it to be placed there.</p> <p>Margaret Taylor, 41 Carnbee Park kindly thanked the committee for their efforts during the past 12 months.</p>	
4	<p>Chairperson's Report</p> <p>Janice will shortly be giving her financial report for this year. This is the first year in our history that our expenditure has been exceeded our income. After the first two years of our existence our bank balance was high due to having taken an unrealistic view of the percentage of owners who would not pay their fees. We had taken advice from other organisations but instead of the expected 75% of owners paying, it was about 95% so we decided to reduce the fees to the present rate. We can view the present position in two ways, we still have a healthy bank balance so do nothing or we can take cognisance of the fact that our costs are going to continue to rise each year and consider what we should do to counter the effect. We may have to face the unpalatable facts that fees must rise, that is something for the new committee to decide. We have not had a very bad winter for a long time but if we had to start removing fallen or damaged trees our bank balance could be fall severely. I would like to thank Janice for the way she has performed her role admirably keeping the committee up to date on the state of our finances.</p> <p>Our committee has performed well as a group but John Whitcelo who had the task of liaising with our ground and tree contractors will not be standing again. This is unfortunate and we really need to fill this vacancy and one or two more members on the committee would be a great help. I fear that we are slipping into the position we were in 2012 when the number of committee</p>	

members was becoming too few to carry out the work imposed on them. I would like to thank John for all he has accomplished in the past.

In 2012 employing a Factor to oversee the work and collect the annual fees was considered. This would have meant a rise in the fees of approximately £35 per household. If we are forced to consider this step again I don't know what the fees would be now but they would be close to £100 I suspect. That would be a steep rise but without any increase in standards on the estate. The factor would still be under the control of the COA Committee. Cath and I have been on the committee from the start. The numbers on the committee grew until 2016 then dropped to our present numbers. We need your help.

Once again trees have caused a lot of work for the committee. Gone are the days when we could phone the tree planning department and speak to someone. Now it is form filling and waiting. We are in a TPO area, tree preservation area for those fortunate enough not to have come into contact with those dreaded letters. Now we can't even touch the self-seeded saplings. Trying to get a decision is time consuming and expensive. Yet the Council can go and cut down a row of perfectly good trees in Princes Street gardens because it interferes with the Christmas Market.

All with the council permission, which was a long time in coming, this year we have removed some young trees in area 10, cleaned some trees out in area 11a and carried out a crown lift on an Ash tree that was causing problems for an owner in Carnbee End. When the accounts are presented you will see that the vast majority of the expenditure is on trees and ground maintenance. I would like to take this opportunity to thank Frontier Forestry and their man on the ground Andrew Jenkins for all his advice and hard work. I would also like to thank the committee for their hard work this year, John Shepherd, Cath Crosbie, Janice McGrath and Elaine Reid.

5	<p>Treasurer's Report</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A copy of the accounts were given to those members present. • Opening balance at 1 Sept 2018 £16,688.22 • Income £11,570.00 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Fees Paid</u>: 21/36 Walker owners (not legally obliged to pay) and 198/204 Beazer owners (2 less than last year). Although this is a 97% payment rate, it has not been an easy journey for me and other committee members chasing up late payments. The latest payment only came in last week which shows how long and drawn out the process of collecting the payments is. I urge all owners to benefit from the £10 discount by paying by 31 December. • <u>Methods of Payment</u>: I am pleased to see a rise in the number of online payments with only 43 paying by cheque (6 of these via IHJ). I remind owners that an online payment needs a reference i.e. your name, house number and street e.g. Adams, 36 Avenue. If this is not done, it is very difficult to identify the property for which the fee has been paid. • Expenditure £12,923.08 • Closing Balance £15,335.14 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bank Balance of £15, 971.14 minus uncashed cheque of £636 Frontier = £15,335.14 <p>Treasurers Report – Main Expenses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Estate Maintenance £8,208.60 (last year £6,813.68) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • £720 + £408 Weed Spraying • £258 dead shrub replacement outside 3 and 51 C Avenue • Annual percentage rise of 3.38% • Tree maintenance £2,976.00 (last year £0.00) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As predicted at last year's AGM tree works have made a bit of a dent in our finances to the tune of nearly £3000. 	
---	--	--

We have a LOT of trees in the estate and this means that this is always going to be an ongoing expense.

- £1770 Area 11A at end of C Park
- £570 strip of woodland to rear of 29 and 31 C Avenue
- £636 Tree works at 7 Carnbee End (cheque not yet cleared)

Treasurers Report – Minor Expenses

	Current year	(Previous year)
• Plants	£0.00	(£0.00)
• Office Expenses	£82.44	(£146.44)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Includes stationery, stamps, photocopying of newsletters and fee letters etc. Hope to cut this down even further by encouraging as many owners as possible to receive everything by email. This also makes it much easier for committee members who have fewer hand deliveries to make. We still have some way to go to achieve 100% electronic communications. 		
• Hire of Rooms	£63.00	(£63.00)
• Public Liability Insurance	£459.62	(£464.62)
• Tree Condition Report	£0.00	(£0.00)
• Website	£69.45	(£69.45)
• SPS Fee Collection / PO Box	£330.00	(£440.00)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Set up a PO Box with Post Office which is working very well and has saved us £110. I did not want my personal address being used on communications but the letters are delivered to me via the PO Box. This meant I could receive fee payment cheques and bank them (now a LOT easier that I can deposit them through my mobile App rather than having to visit the bank every week. It is still our aim to get as many owners as possible to pay by online banking. This certainly makes it a lot easier for our record keeping. 		

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Debt Recovery £534.00 (€352.18) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the interests of fairness to all owners, the committee pursues all unpaid fees through IHJ Debt collection Agency. However, this comes at a cost. This year we have had to pay out £534.00 for the recovery of £1075.00. The charges for Debt recovery letters are £50 + VAT = £60 on debts recovered up to £1300 and 4% on debts in excess of £1300. The committee agreed this year that this cost should be added to the debt (£55 + £60 = £115) and so for unpaid fees the debt is £115 per year as at the current fee rate. Again, we encourage all owners to avoid these costs by paying their fees on time. • Refund £200 (€115.00) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Believe it or not, some owners paid their fees twice! Whilst that was very nice, we obviously had to issue refund cheques. <p>The future</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This is a matter for the new committee. <p>Auditor</p> <p>On behalf of the committee, I would like to thank Colin Knox, who lives on the estate, for auditing the accounts once again this year. He doesn't have a huge timescale in which to do the work as the end of the financial year is 31 August and of course the AGM is in the beginning of September. Colin does this work free of charge for which we are all very grateful.</p>	
6	<p>Committee Elections</p> <p>An election was held in accordance with the Constitution the following individuals were formally elected to serve until the 2020 AGM.</p> <p>Chairperson Name John Pendlebury Proposer C. Crosbie, 29 Carnbee Park Seconder J. Monaghan, 32 Carnbee Crescent</p>	

	<p>Vice Chairperson Name John Shepherd Proposer E. Greive, 13 Carnbee End Seconder E. Turbitt, 16 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Treasurer Name Janice McGrath Proposer J. Monaghan, 32 Carnbee Crescent Seconder E. Stott, 61 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Secretary Cath Crosbie Proposer P. Millican, 35 Carnbee Park Seconder E. Turbitt, 16 Carnbee Park</p> <p>General Members Elaine Reid, Proposer J. Pendlebury 17 Carnbee Park Seconder J. Monaghan, 32 Carnbee Crescent</p> <p>John Shepherd, 17 Carnbee End, proposed Ewan McCrae, 38 Carnbee Park as a committee member for the coming year.</p> <p>John asked if anyone else wished to stand for election and there were no volunteers.</p>	
7	<p>Owner Questions</p> <p>Eleanor Grieve, 13 Carnbee End Eleanor mentioned that there were branches and brambles overhanging the fences of properties, 12, 13, 14 and 15 Carnbee End, (Area 11). John Pendlebury stated that we would get our tree surgeon out to look at this area.</p> <p>Christine MacMichael, 12 Carnbee End Christine mentioned that she had read on our website that some trees were due for re-inspection in September 2019. Cath Crosbie said that the committee would check this and action if necessary.</p> <p>Brian Whigham, 33/3 Carnbee Avenue Brian advised that fly tipping was happening in our communal area 10 adjacent to Ellen's Glen Road. Cath Crosbie stated that the cost of removal of rubbish caused by fly tipping on our communal areas</p>	<p>Committee</p> <p>Committee</p>

	<p>would have to be footed by the association. The committee were not aware of this and advised Brian that we would check it out and deal with it.</p> <p>Elaine Turbitt, 16 Carnbee Park Elaine kindly thanked the committee for their work during the past 12 months.</p>	Committee
9	<p>Meeting Close</p> <p>The minutes from tonight's meeting will be published on our website within 28 days of this meeting. If you require a paper copy, then please let us know and we'll be happy to deliver this to you.</p> <p>I would like to thank you all for attending this evening.</p>	