



Carnbee Owners Association

Minutes of Meeting held on Tuesday 26th October 2021 at 7:30pm

Location – Liberton Bowling Club

Present: John Shepherd (Vice Chairperson)
 Janice McGrath (Treasurer)
 Cath Crosbie (Secretary)
 Sarah-Louise Halliday (Committee Member)
 David Hutton (Charles White Ltd)
 25 Carnbee Owners

Item	Details	Actions
1	<p>Welcome</p> <p>John Shepherd welcomed all attendees to the meeting.</p>	
2	<p>Vice-Chair Introduction – John Shepherd</p> <p>Good evening, everyone,</p> <p>I hope you are well, and I would like to thank you all for coming along this evening for this Carnbee Owners Association General Business Meeting.</p> <p>Today's General Business Meeting is being held following the outcome of the postal vote on passing the administration of the estate over to a factor, Charles White, with a committee of owners, allowing us to hold a formal vote with the association members on this matter.</p> <p>On a personal note, whatever the outcome tonight, this will be my last duty as a committee member, so I'd like to take the opportunity to express my thanks and admiration of all committee members past and present, but in particular Cath and Janice who have taken on the vast majority of work over the past few years. Work that has really made a difference to the upkeep of the estate. I've been able to observe the little things that make a big difference and that may go in noticed, like the constant battles with the council to get things like overflowing bins emptied, road repairs that are not completed properly, sorted. Picking up with the CityFibre contractors about all the snagging issues outstanding once they thought they had completed the work.</p> <p>For me the enduring testimonial of the committee is the wooded area between Carnbee Avenue and End. When I arrived on the estate it was just an overgrown mess, which has been turned into a delightful area for all to enjoy.</p>	

	Thank you, ladies. I will now hand across to David Hutton from Charles White Ltd.	
3	<p>David Hutton from Charles White - Discussion of Management Proposal and cost:</p> <p>Thank you for the invitation and introduction. It has been requested that I cover four areas:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Charles White Ltd – an introduction 2. The year 1 proposal document circulated to the committee 3. Sinking fund 4. Proposal for the Walker Homes properties <p>1. <u>Charles White Ltd</u></p> <p>Charles White Ltd are a company dating back to 1840 with old fashion values, our driver is making a difference. We are one of two residential property management Edinburgh based companies with 30 people based in an open plan office in Haymarket.</p> <p>Property Management in Scotland is unique in that Property Factors are required to work within a set of regulations known as the Property Factors Act, meaning that customers of Property Factors have an ombudsman to turn to if required.</p> <p>The Charles White team comprises four core areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Client Relationship Manager – each property has a dedicated Client Relationship Manager - Property Inspector – from a trades or technical property background to carry out property inspections and liaise with contractors. - Client Account Manager – to manage finances - Team Administrator – to assist the team as a whole. <p>Factoring fees comprise services charges plus management fees: - arranging services on behalf of owners, managing contractors and suppliers, settling accounts, collecting payments, management of credit control, attending AGMs, meetings with the Committee, preparing an annual budget, issuing correspondence, issuing invoices, managing the account, and site inspection visits. Charles White Ltd have an online facility where you can register for free, download information and make payments. Most clients are registered with the portal and pay by</p>	

monthly Direct Debit.

2. Proposal – year 1 budget based on information provided to Charles White Ltd by the committee

Owners will receive a copy of the annual budget and associated invoice. Owners can choose to settle the invoice up front or spread the cost via Direct Debit over the course of the year.

Charles White aim to make this process as transparent as possible to ensure that owners know what their costs are in advance and the work to be carried out. The costs included in the budget are as follows:

- I. Grounds maintenance - retaining your existing gardener (Greenfingers).
- II. Grounds improvements – planting & additional works previously approved to be carried out by Greenfingers
- III. Credit transfer – There is currently a surplus in your current bank account and part of the surplus will be used to off-set the grounds improvements costs
- IV. Tree maintenance – a tree surgeon report from Mike Charkow dated May 2020 commissioned by your committee. Inspected & recorded 57 trees. The inspection found 41 trees in good condition, 13 trees in moderate condition and 3 trees in poor condition causing risk. It is recommended that urgent attention is paid to 6 trees within 12 months: a dead Ash to be removed, a damaged Red Cedar to be removed, a Holly and a Beech to be pruned, deadwood around a Lime to be removed and to remove a cage & stake on a Whitebeam. An additional 2 trees should be attended to within 24 months and all trees should be reinspected in 5 years.
- V. Public liability insurance - £25M cover if anyone is injured or worse on your property.
- VI. Hire of a hall for committee meetings. This is a provisional sum.
- VII. Charles White Ltd management fee - £3.75 +VAT per property per month
- VIII. Estimated net running cost for the estate in year 1 is **£20,599.14**
- IX. Total cost per property for year **£100.98**

	<p>X. Total cost per property per month <u>£8.41</u></p> <p>3. <u>Sinking fund</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ With the approval of owners Charles White Ltd can implement a Sinking Fund at the start of a budget year ○ The main purpose of a sinking fund is to off-set some future large cost – with your development that is likely to be significant maintenance of the trees, tree inspections and large adhoc replanting from time to time. ○ The Sinking fund is non-refundable and would transfer with the property. The existence of a Sinking Fund can be attractive to any potential purchasers. ○ Charles White Ltd recommend around £5 per owner per year however it would be preferential to review after one year of management to all CW to get a feel for the development. ○ The Sinking Fund discussion can be picked up at a later committee meeting. <p>4. <u>Walker Homes Residents</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Only the owners of the 204 Beazer properties have the power to appoint Charles White Ltd and they are Charles White Ltd principals. ○ That said since many of the 36 Walker properties have enjoyed the amenity of the common areas and have been contributing to the running costs of the estate over the years. Charles White Ltd can raise a separate invoice to those properties. Monies collected within the year would then be transferred as a credit to the annual budget for the following year. Charles White Ltd would continue to do that on a rolling basis and propose to charge those properties £65 per year of which £12+VAT would be to help cover the administrative cost. ○ CWL do not have a legal basis on which to pursue outstanding balances from the Walker Homes. <p>DH noted that a float of £20 per household would be required to ensure sufficient funding in the account. This will be refundable to each owner if the property is sold and noted that all accounts are ringfenced and protected up to £85,000.</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>The following questions were asked:</p> <p>Konstantin Kamenev – 48 Carnbee Park</p> <p>What landscaping improvements have been instructed? CC advised that these were improvements to the entrance and roundabout areas. A breakdown of the repairs and the quote will be provided to the new committee for information.</p> <p>Isabelle Hanlon – 66 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Asked about the ownership of certain trees within the estate. CC confirmed that the trees in question are owned and maintained by the owners on the Carnbee Estate. A further question was asked about the ownership of the trees and wall on Ellen’s Glen Road. It was confirmed that these trees/walls belong to Southfield House.</p> <p>Konstantin Kamenev – 48 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Asked when any contract with Charles White would be renewed. DH confirmed that the contract would initially be for one year but with a 2-month termination provision thereafter to ensure a smooth handover to any other Factor appointed, or back to the committee.</p> <p>Konstantin Kamenev – 48 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Asked if the budget would be agreed with the committee annual. DH confirmed that it would be.</p> <p>Colin Snodgrass – 9 Carnbee Park</p> <p>Asked if the current surplus could be used to fund the float or if payment should be separate. DH noted this could be decided by the committee. A discussion was held, and it was agreed that it would be cleaner to request £20 from each owner and leave the surplus to fund any major works (to trees etc.).</p>	
4	<p>Any questions submitted by owners by 19 October 2021.</p> <p>No questions were submitted in advance of the meeting.</p>	



5	<p>Vote for passing admin of estate over to CW</p> <p>The vote was held, and the results announced below</p>	
6	<p>Announce proxy and vote result</p> <p>The proxy/in-person vote result was announced as follows:</p> <p>Votes in Favour of appointing Charles White as Factor</p> <p>46 Papers in Favour</p> <p>29 Households present in Favour</p> <p>28 Emails in Favour</p> <p>1 Paper not in Favour</p> <p>Total 103 in Favour</p> <p>1 not in Favour</p> <p>Charles White will be appointed as Factor as per the result of the vote.</p>	
7	<p>Meeting Close – Cath Crosbie</p> <p>Since 2009 volunteer owners have run the Carnbee Owners Association, allowing all owners to pay very low estate maintenance fees. I think owners have made the correct decision to pass the administration of the estate over to Charles White during our postal vote in June.</p> <p>It is great news that we now have new committee members who will be able to keep a close eye on our estate and liaise closely with Charles White to ensure our estate remains maintained and well cared for. This of course is beneficial to us all aesthetically and to ensure we can obtain a good price when we come to sell our properties.</p> <p>I just wanted to say a huge thank you to all the committee members who have served on the committee over the past 13 years. I want to especially thank John Pendlebury, John Shepherd and Janice McGrath who have worked so very hard to take the administration over to Charles White this year under very difficult circumstances due to Covid-19 restrictions.</p> <p>Also, just a footnote, minutes from tonight’s meeting will be posted on</p>	



	<p>the website within 28 days and if you require a paper copy then please email contact@carnbee.org</p> <p>Thank you very much to all owners for attending this evening.</p> <p>It was then agreed that the new committee, voted in at the last meeting, will take over from the close of this meeting.</p> <p>The meeting closed at 8:50pm</p>	
--	--	--

*Following the meeting, the committee held a vote to appoint a new Treasurer (Janice McGrath to Sarah-Louise Halliday). The result was as follows:

Proposer - Alan Carmichael

Secunder - Andy Reid

Sarah-Louise Halliday was appointed Treasurer.

** It was decided that a walkround handover from the outgoing committee members to the new committee members would be useful. This will be arranged over the coming weeks.

*** The newly appointed Secretary has resigned; therefore, a new Secretary should be appointed. The new committee will appoint a new Secretary.